

# Australia & New Zealand Society of Criminology

## Report on Criminology Bibliometrics Development

Mark Brown and Kathleen Daly

15 November 2007

Released 25 February 2008

*Note:* This report was written before the Australian Federal election, in accordance with the expedited deadlines imposed by DEST for the Research Quality Framework (RQF). It was sent to DEST on 16 November 2007 with a request to advise on when the rankings could be released and to receive the outcomes of the rankings in the other disciplines (e.g., psychology, law, sociology, history, politics, gender studies, Indigenous studies). Our contacts at DEST never replied. Although the pre-election RQF exercise is no longer operative, we expect that metrics will assume importance in a future similar exercise. This document describes the work of ANZSOC in assisting DEST to come up with rankings of journals and publishing outlets. Departments and research centres may find it useful to guide decisions on the quality of publishing outlets. MB & KD

Update 15 May 2008

During a review of this Bibliometric, it became apparent that two databases used to construct the list of criminology journal titles had listed, respectively, the old and the new names of the journal that now carries the title *Criminology and Criminal Justice*. The panel of experts ranked each title at the same level, i.e., Tier A. This error has now been identified. We have rectified it by removing the old title (*Criminal Justice*) and leaving the new and current title, *Criminology and Criminal Justice*, at Tier A. This reduced the number of journals in Tier A to 14, and the total number of journals ranked to 111. MB

\*\*\*\*\*

As of this writing, the Research Quality Framework (RQF) will involve the separate assessment of research quality and research impact. For disciplines where rates of citation are not high (and this is the case for criminology), alternative measures of quality have been sought. One means of estimating the quality of individual papers is to use the quality of the journal in which they are published as a proxy. In order to undertake this form of assessment, some form of

ranking of journals is required. The output of such a ranking exercise is termed a bibliometric, and this paper outlines the steps by which the Criminology Bibliometric was established.

In August 2007 DEST began development of bibliometrics for all disciplines. Learned societies and associations (such as ANZSOC) were contacted and given responsibility for coordinating the discipline's ranking of its publishing outlets. This included both journals and publishers. In respect of journals, a list of all journals in which Australian criminology academics had published during the RQF census period (2001-2006) was used as a base-list. Any non-peer reviewed journals were removed. To the list were added any peer reviewed journals catalogued by Thompson ISI and not already listed. A further list of journals compiled by the European Science Foundation was used to pick up more peer reviewed criminology journals. And finally, a list recently compiled by the University of Maryland was consulted and a few additional journals added to the list. The result was a master list of 148 peer reviewed journals. This list included some cross-disciplinary journals, but scholars who publish across disciplines or within other disciplinary areas (such as psychology, history, politics, feminist and Indigenous studies) will find that these journals will be ranked by other groups. The book publishers list was based on Australian universities' publication data plus any further relevant publishers added as the exercise proceeded.

DEST required journals and publishers to be ranked into four quality tiers. Key to this was a percentage system whereby each tier would comprise a set proportion of the total number of journals and publishers. The tiers were as follows: A\* (top 5%; or no more than about 5 to 6 journals, or 3 publishers), A (next 15%, no more than 15 journals, or 9 publishers), B (next 30%, no more than 25 journals, or 18 publishers) and C (remaining 50%). They also provided guidelines for the ranking process. First, an expert panel was to be established to produce a first "rough cut" ranking. Second, that ranking was to be sent to the discipline for comment, feedback and, if necessary, claims for re-ranking of some journals. Finally, the project coordinator with assistance from the expert panel would review discipline feedback and produce the final bibliometric.

Kathy Daly as President of ANZSOC appointed Mark Brown to coordinate this process. Together, we selected the “expert panel” which, after a number of declined invitations due to work commitments and suchlike, comprised the following:

- Chris Cunneen (UNSW)
- Kathy Daly & Paul Mazerolle (Griffith)
- Mark Brown (Melbourne)
- Mark Finnane (Griffith – publishers only)
- Peter Grabosky (ANU)
- Mark Israel & Andrew Goldsmith (Flinders)
- Toni Makkai (AIC)
- Jude McCulloch (Monash)
- Pat O'Malley (Sydney)

Experts were asked to rank journals and publishers into tiers based upon the percentage proportions stipulated by DEST. Several memos were sent to the experts to guide the process and to assist in reaching their judgments, based on DEST instructions. Descriptors of quality that DEST gave for A\*, A, and B journal outlets were as follows:

**A\* (top 5%):** Contains the highest quality papers from the world’s leading researchers; the editorial board is also composed of world leaders; rejection rates are normally very high; very robust peer review process (double blind?); junior academics would shout a round of drinks the first time they got a paper accepted in one of these journals.

**A (next 15%):** Also publishes very high quality papers with a significant proportion coming from the world’s leading researchers; could be the leading journal in a sub-discipline; the editorial board contains many leading researchers; senior academics would routinely publish in these journals, and junior academics would strive to get their best work accepted here; normally high rejection rate.

**B (next 25%):** Most articles are methodologically sound, and there is a robust peer review process; PhD students would usually aim for these journals and PostDocs would expect to publish in them; solid editorial board with perhaps a modest representation of top researchers.

On some criteria (e.g., where PhD students may publish their work), we might disagree with DEST's logic. However, these were the rules of thumb they supplied us.

DEST stipulated that the ranking should be of criminology and criminal justice research outlets, not of those outlets which Australian criminologists may regularly publish; and the ranking is of "quality," not of importance (e.g., "it is important that we promote Australian outlets"), influence (e.g., "it is read by 10,000 probation officers"), or venerability (e.g., "it is the oldest journal in criminology").

The list of journals circulated to the expert panel also contained information provided by the Research Evaluation and Policy Project (REPP) from the ANU, the journal's ISI impact factor, and UQ rankings (these was supplied by DEST). To these we added the recently released University of Maryland rankings. This information was provided to assist the expert group, and we assumed that DEST would have an eye to it when reviewing the final set of rankings.

Rankings provided by the expert panel were then collated by Mark Brown to form the "first cut" ranking. During this process it was decided that although it was possible to rank publishers in four categories, it was not meaningful nor useful to adopt DEST's stringent percentage criteria for the number of publishers in each category. From this point onward, the ranking exercise focused on journal outlets only.

The expert panel's journal ranking was circulated to criminology department heads or program leaders for comment, including a pro forma to be completed for cases where their group wished a journal to be considered for re-ranking. Two important points were emphasised at this phase. First, it was noted that this sort of process would always generate different opinions about journals' relative standing. However, what was required was a sense of whether or not things looked broadly right, that certain journals had not been egregiously under or over rated. Second, it was pointed out that DEST's intention was for this exercise to serve as a basis for future development, so that over time we might see changes in

these rankings. Requests for feedback on the rankings were then sent to the following:

- John Braithwaite (ANU)
- Rod Broadhurst (QUT)
- David Brown (UNSW)
- Kerry Carrington (UNE)
- Duncan Chappell (Sydney)
- Garry Coventry (James Cook)
- Sue Davies (La Trobe)
- Bee Chen Goh (Southern Cross)
- Andrew Goldsmith (Flinders)
- Fiona Haines (Melbourne)
- Mary Hawkins (UWS)
- Janeen Baxter (Queensland)
- Marg Liddell (RMIT)
- Jude McCulloch (Monash)
- Frank Morgan (UWA)
- Darren Palmer (Deakin)
- Leonora Ritter (Charles Sturt)
- Rick Sarre (South Australia)
- Mark Stoney (Edith Cowan)
- David Tait (Canberra)
- Rob White (Tasmania)
- Paul Wilson (Bond)
- Richard Wortley (Griffith)

A limited number of responses was received. Four broad observations can be made from the content of the responses. First, most who responded felt the ranking generally looked quite good. Second, most of these respondents also identified two or three journals they thought were borderline for movement up or down, but didn't wish to make a strong case for re-ranking so much as to make the observation itself. Third, one discipline group raised a case for re-ranking. Advice was sought from the expert panel and it was decided not to adjust the rankings. Finally, it was acknowledged that the Bibliometric is weak in recognizing cross-

disciplinary or novel work, a problem that has been repeatedly noted by other disciplines.

The creation of this first Criminology Bibliometric has been an informative, although at times a challenging process. Based on the responses of the expert panel and the wider discipline, most people are satisfied with the results and the process has gone smoothly. The resulting metric provides insight how Australian criminologists view the journal outlets in which we publish our work. It will be but one means by which RQF assessors will seek to determine the quality of our work.

## RANKING OF CRIMINOLOGY JOURNALS

*Note:* DEST sent ANZSOC 143 journals to rank, to which Brown and Daly added five. The list of 148 was circulated, and four more were added by members of the expert panel, for a total of 152. A total of 111 journals were ranked, and an additional 12 were proposed to move to another group. Some 28 journals were unknown by the members of the expert panel and could not be ranked. This is the first bibliometric exercise in Australian criminology, and will, no doubt, invite debate.

### **Rank A\* (N=6)**

British Journal of Criminology  
 Crime and Justice: A Review of Research (invited only, annual book, does not take unsolicited material)  
 Criminology  
 Law and Society Review  
 Punishment and Society  
 Theoretical Criminology

### **Rank A (N=14)**

Advances in Criminological Theory (in book form, unclear if it takes unsolicited material)  
 Australian and New Zealand Journal of Criminology  
 Crime & Delinquency  
 Criminal Justice and Behavior  
 Criminology & Criminal Justice: an international journal  
 Journal of Criminal Law & Criminology  
 Journal of Law and Society  
 Journal of Quantitative Criminology  
 Journal of Research in Crime and Delinquency  
 Justice Quarterly  
 Law and Policy  
 Law and Social Inquiry  
 Policing and Society  
 Social and Legal Studies

### **Rank B (N=24)**

Acta Criminologica  
 Canadian Journal of Criminology and Criminal Justice  
 Crime Law and Social Change  
 Crime Media Culture  
 Crime Prevention and Community Safety  
 Criminology and Public Policy  
 Critical Criminology  
 Current Issues in Criminal Justice  
 European Journal of Criminology  
 Feminist Criminology  
 Homicide Studies: an interdisciplinary & international journal  
 Howard Journal of Criminal Justice  
 International Journal of the Sociology of Law  
 International Review of Victimology

Journal of Criminal Justice  
 Journal of Experimental Criminology  
 Law and Contemporary Problems  
 Police Practice and Research: an international journal  
 Police Quarterly  
 Policing: a journal of policy and practice (Oxford)  
 Social Justice: a journal of crime, conflict, and world order  
 Trends and Issues in Crime and Criminal Justice  
 Violence Against Women  
 Youth Justice

**Rank C1: upper half (ranked 'B' by one expert, but pushed to C with % constraints)**  
**(N=36)**

Aggression and Violent Behaviour  
 Asian Journal of Criminology  
 Australian Journal of Social Issues  
 British Journal of Community Justice  
 Canadian Journal of Law and Society  
 Contemporary Justice Review  
 Crime, Histoire et Sociétés  
 Criminal Behaviour and Mental Health  
 Criminal Justice Ethics  
 European Journal of Crime, Criminal Law and Criminal Justice  
 Federal Probation  
 Global Crime  
 International Criminal Justice Review  
 International Journal of Law and Psychiatry  
 International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology  
 Journal for Crime, Conflict and Media Culture  
 Journal of Crime & Justice  
 Journal of Criminal Justice and Popular Culture  
 Journal of Criminal Justice Education  
 Journal of Empirical Legal Studies  
 Journal of Family Violence  
 Journal of Financial Crime  
 Journal of Gang Research  
 Journal of Interpersonal Violence  
 Journal of Money Laundering Control  
 Journal of Scandinavian Studies in Criminology and Crime Prevention  
 Policing: an international journal of police strategies and management (Bradford)  
 Prison Journal  
 Probation Journal: the journal of community and criminal justice  
 Regulation & Governance  
 Security Journal  
 Terrorism and Political Violence  
 Victims & Offenders  
 Violence and Victims  
 Western Criminology Review  
 Youth Violence and Juvenile Justice

**Rank C2 (bottom half) (N=31)**

African Journal of Criminology and Justice Studies  
 American Journal of Criminal Justice  
 Annual Editions: Criminal Justice  
 Asia Pacific Journal on Human Rights and the Law  
 Canadian Journal of Police and Security Services  
 Caribbean Journal of Criminology & Social Psychology  
 Corrections Management Quarterly  
 Criminal Justice  
 Criminal Law Forum: official journal of the Society for the Reform of Criminal  
 Law  
 Criminal Law Review  
 Ethics and Justice: an interdisciplinary public affairs journal  
 Indian Journal of Criminology  
 International Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal Justice  
 International Journal of Comparative Criminology  
 Internet Journal of Criminology  
 Journal for Juvenile Justice and Detention Services  
 Journal of Addictions & Offender Counseling  
 Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice  
 Journal of Correctional Education  
 Journal of Drug Issues  
 Journal of Education and the Law  
 Journal of Forensic Document Examination  
 Journal of Homeland Security and Emergency Management  
 Journal of Law Medicine and Ethics  
 Journal of National Security Law & Policy  
 Journal of Offender Rehabilitation: a multidisciplinary journal of innovation in  
 research, services, and programs in corrections and criminal justice  
 Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology  
 Journal of Security Administration  
 Justice Research and Policy  
 Prison Service Journal  
 The Police Journal: a quarterly review for the police forces of the Commonwealth  
 and English-speaking world

**Journals suggested be moved to another group (N=12)*****Law***

Alternative Law Journal  
 American Criminal Law Review  
 Australian Journal of Legal Philosophy  
 Criminal Law Journal  
 Criminal Law Quarterly  
 Juvenile and Family Court Journal  
 Melbourne University Law Review

***Psychology***

Psychiatry, Psychology and Law  
 Psychology Public Policy and Law

Psychology, Crime and Law  
 Psychiatry, Psychology and Law

***Sociology***

Deviant Behavior: an interdisciplinary journal

**RANKING OF CRIMINOLOGY PUBLISHERS**

Note: It was possible to rank publishers in four categories, but it was not meaningful nor useful to adopt DEST's stringent percentage criteria for the number of publishers in each category.

**Rank A\***

Cambridge University Press  
 Oxford University Press  
 Princeton University Press  
 University of Chicago Press  
 Harvard University Press  
 Yale University Press  
 Routledge (assume Routledge and Routledge Taylor Francis are the same)

**Rank A**

Ashgate (assume that Ashgate and Ashgate Publishing are the same)  
 Hart Publishing  
 McGraw-Hill  
 John Wiley & Sons  
 Palgrave MacMillan  
 Sage Publications  
 University of Michigan Press  
 University of Toronto Press  
 Willan Publishing  
 Blackwell  
 Polity  
 Springer  
 Cavendish Press (from 2006, Cavendish/Glasshouse is part of Routledge)  
 Glasshouse Press (Glasshouse is an imprint of Cavendish)  
 Manchester University Press

**Rank B**

Australian Institute of Criminology  
 Butterworths  
 Carolina Academic Press  
 Criminal Justice Press  
 Dartmouth Publishing Company Ltd (should this be part of Ashgate)  
 Federation Press  
 Greenwood Press  
 Hawkins Press  
 Lexington Books: Rowman Littlefield Publishing  
 LexisNexis Butterworths (combined with LexisNexis)

Melbourne Publishing Group (assume to be same as Melbourne University  
Publishing, formerly Melbourne University Press)  
Prentice-Hall  
State University of New York Press  
Sweet and Maxwell  
Sydney Institute of Criminology  
Thomson Law Book Company  
UNSW Press  
University Of North Carolina Press  
Westview Press  
Open University Press

**Rank C**

Academy of Social Sciences in Australia and Australian Psychological Society  
Allen and Unwin  
Anderson Publishing Co  
Australasian Society for HIV Medicine  
Australian Academy of Humanities  
Australian Scholarly Publishing Pty Ltd  
Black Inc  
Brill Academic Publishers  
Canterbury University Press  
Circa/Melbourne Publishing Group (uncertainly about Circa's relationship to  
Melbourne Publishing Group; see note in Tier B)  
CQU Press  
Edward Elgar Publishing  
Henry Stewart Publications  
Hong Kong University Press  
Institute of Policy Studies  
LBC Information Services  
Martinus Nijhoff Publishers  
Nova Science Publishers  
Otago University Print  
Pandanus Books  
PIPSA & University of the Sunshine Coast Press  
Rockefeller University Press  
Transaction Publishers  
Wakefield Press  
Zed Books Ltd